



Testimony before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
Regarding Congregation Shearith Israel Synagogue
Application for Certificate of Appropriateness and 74-711
November 26, 2002

Good afternoon, Commissioners. I'm Vicki Weiner, Kress Fellow for Historic Preservation at the Municipal Art Society of New York. The Society's Preservation Committee received a presentation by representatives of Congregation Shearith Israel describing their Certificate of Appropriateness and 74-711 zoning applications. They outlined the nature of these requests, the special provisions being sought, and the way they believe the preservation purpose criterion for the 74-711 is met by the proposal. They also presented designs for the new building and made their arguments for its appropriateness. In its discussion, the Preservation Committee identified three issues that we feel are key.

First, the issue of height and massing of the new building. the Committee was divided over whether or not the building height and massing are appropriate to the historic district. A slight majority of members felt that on this particular streetscape, and in this location, a fourteen-story building is appropriate to the neighborhood. Others did not, expressing concern about the tower's relationship to the low rise buildings in the middle of the block.

Second, the issue of design. the Committee found the design to be inappropriate for the historic district. A number of design components appeared to be unresolved, such as the overall fenestration and the penthouse proportions. In addition, the Committee questioned the relationship between the Synagogue entrance and the residential entrance.

Third, the validity of authorizing the shifting of bulk under 74-711. the Committee felt the preservation purpose as described was not compelling enough to warrant this action. The restorative elements mentioned to us, such as replacement of the roof and addressing water damage, appeared to the Committee to be more on the order of routine maintenance. We appreciate the Synagogue's past attention to restoring its building, but would like to be assured that there is a comprehensive preservation program in place. We were not provided with any details regarding a continuing maintenance plan, nor was there any indication of how revenues generated by the proposed project would meet expenses for restoration of the Synagogue.

Testimony before the Landmarks Preservation Commission
Regarding Congregation Shearith Israel
Page 2

Based upon the Committee's review, we believe that the Landmarks Preservation Commission should not approve the Certificate of Appropriateness or the 74-711 authorization at this time. We look forward to future discussion of this proposal as it evolves.

Thank you for this opportunity to express the Society's views.



THE NEW YORK CITY LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

1 CENTRE STREET, 9TH FLOOR, NEW YORK NY 10007 TEL: 212-669-7923 FAX: 212-669-7797



<http://nyc.gov.landmarks>

If you wish to speak, please complete this form. In order to give others an opportunity to speak, all speakers are asked to limit their remarks to three minutes.

PUBLIC HEARING SPEAKERS' SIGN IN SHEET

Date 7 / 1 / 03

Item # _____ Item Address 8 W 70th St.

_____ In favor of proposal ☒ Against proposal _____ Other position

State Senator Thomas K. Duane

Name

494 Eighth Avenue NY NY 10001

Address

29th New York State Senatorial District

Representing

If you would rather leave a statement, complete and return to the Reception Desk, or mail the form to the Commission at the above address, attention: Diane Jackier, Director of Community and Government Affairs.

If you need additional space, please use the other side.